

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-11557-RA**

New York Civil Liberties Union v. United States Immigration  
and Customs Enforcement  
Assigned to: Judge Ronnie Abrams  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 12/11/2018  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**New York Civil Liberties Union**

represented by **Amy Belsher**  
New York Civil Liberties Union  
125 Broad Street, 19th Floor  
New York, NY 10024  
212-607-3300  
Email: [abelsher@nyclu.org](mailto:abelsher@nyclu.org)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Paige Austin**  
Make the Road New York  
311 Grove St.  
Brooklyn, NY 11237  
718-418-7690  
Email: [paustin@nyclu.org](mailto:paustin@nyclu.org)  
**TERMINATED: 02/15/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Antony Philip Falconer Gemmell**  
New York Civil Liberties Union  
125 Broad Street, 19th Floor  
New York, NY 10024  
212-607-3320  
Email: [agemmell@nyclu.org](mailto:agemmell@nyclu.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Christopher T Dunn**  
New York Civil Liberties Union  
125 Broad Street, 17th floor  
New York, NY 10004  
(212) 344-3005  
Fax: (212) 344-3318  
Email: [cdunn@nyclu.org](mailto:cdunn@nyclu.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**United States Immigration and  
Customs Enforcement**

represented by **Andrew Edward Krause**  
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY  
86 Chambers Street, 3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 637-2769  
Fax: (212) 637-2786  
Email: [andrew.krause@usdoj.gov](mailto:andrew.krause@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

12/11/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-16035069) Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FOIA Request)(Austin, Paige) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
12/11/2018	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Austin, Paige) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
12/11/2018	<u>3</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Austin, Paige) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
12/12/2018		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING CIVIL. CASE OPENING STATISTICAL ERROR CORRECTION: Notice to attorney Paige Austin. The following case opening statistical information was erroneously selected/entered: Fee Status code due (due);. The following correction(s) have been made to your case entry: the Fee Status code has been modified to pd (paid);. (pc)</b> (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/12/2018		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above-entitled action is assigned to Judge Ronnie Abrams. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (pc) (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/12/2018		Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (pc) (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/12/2018		Case Designated ECF. (pc) (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/12/2018	<u>4</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Austin, Paige) (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/13/2018	<u>5</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (dnh) (Entered: 12/13/2018)
12/17/2018	<u>6</u>	ORDER: This case has been assigned to me for all purposes. Plaintiff is directed to notify the Court when service has been executed on Defendant, after which the Court will promptly schedule an initial conference. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/17/2018) (anc) (Entered: 12/17/2018)
12/17/2018	<u>7</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Christopher T Dunn on behalf of New York Civil Liberties Union. (Dunn, Christopher) (Entered: 12/17/2018)
12/18/2018	<u>8</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE) Summons and Complaint served. United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 12/18/2018, answer due 1/17/2019. Service was accepted by Haojun Li, Civil Clerk. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service, # <u>2</u> Exhibit to Affidavit)(Austin, Paige) (Entered: 12/18/2018)
12/18/2018	<u>9</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Andrew Edward Krause on behalf of United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 12/18/2018)
12/20/2018	<u>10</u>	ORDER AND NOTICE OF INITIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 1/25/2019 at 11:15 AM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Foley Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/20/2018) (rj) (Entered: 12/20/2018)
12/27/2018	<u>11</u>	STANDING ORDER M10-468: The United States Attorney's Office shall notify the Court immediately upon the restoration of Department of Justice funding. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/27/18) (yv) (Entered: 01/02/2019)

01/30/2019	<u>12</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Court's Order and Notice of Initial Conference served on Andrew Krause on January 30, 2019. Service was accepted by Andrew Krause, Assistant U.S. Attorney. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Austin, Paige) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
02/06/2019	<u>13</u>	ORDER: Counsel for all parties shall appear for an initial status conference on March 8, 2019 at 2:30 p.m. in Courtroom 1506 of the U.S. District Court for the Southern District of New York, 40 Foley Square, New York, New York. No later than March 1, 2019, the parties shall submit a joint pre-conference letter providing the information requested in the Order at docket entry 10. SO ORDERED. Initial Conference set for 3/8/2019 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 2/6/2019) (ne) (Entered: 02/06/2019)
02/14/2019	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Paige Parker Austin to Withdraw as Attorney <i>for Plaintiff</i> . Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Austin, Paige) (Entered: 02/14/2019)
02/15/2019	<u>15</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Antony Philip Falconer Gemmell on behalf of New York Civil Liberties Union. (Gemmell, Antony) (Entered: 02/15/2019)
02/15/2019	<u>16</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting <u>14</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. ENDORSEMENT: APPLICATION GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Attorney Paige Austin terminated.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 2/15/2019) (rro) (Entered: 02/19/2019)
02/21/2019	<u>17</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY</b> – MOTION for Amy Louise Belsher to Appear Pro Hac Vice <i>for Plaintiff</i> . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16381098. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Affidavit in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice)(Belsher, Amy) Modified on 2/21/2019 (wb). (Entered: 02/21/2019)
02/21/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING DEFICIENT MOTION TO APPEAR PRO HAC VICE. Notice to RE-FILE Document No. <u>17</u> MOTION for Amy Louise Belsher to Appear Pro Hac Vice <i>for Plaintiff</i>. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16381098. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff... The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): missing Certificate of Good Standing from Supreme Court of California;. Re-file the motion as a Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice – attach the correct signed PDF – select the correct named filer/filers – attach valid Certificates of Good Standing issued within the past 30 days – attach Proposed Order.. (wb) (Entered: 02/21/2019)</b>
02/21/2019	<u>18</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 02/21/2019)
02/25/2019	<u>19</u>	MOTION for Amy Louise Belsher to Appear Pro Hac Vice <i>for Plaintiff</i> . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16398134. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Supplement in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>3</u> Supplement in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order in support of Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice)(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 02/25/2019)
02/25/2019		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>19</u> MOTION for Amy Louise Belsher to Appear Pro Hac Vice <i>for Plaintiff</i>. Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16398134. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (ma) (Entered: 02/25/2019)</b>
02/26/2019	20	ORDER granting <u>19</u> Motion for Amy Louise Belsher to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Ronnie Abrams)(Text Only Order) (arc) (Entered: 02/26/2019)
03/01/2019	<u>21</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Both Parties dated 3/1/19 re: Joint Pre-conference Letter Providing Information Requested by Court (ECF 10). Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 03/01/2019)

		03/01/2019)
03/08/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 3/8/2019. (arc) (Entered: 03/08/2019)
03/08/2019	<u>22</u>	ORDER: As discussed at today's conference, the parties shall submit a joint status letter no later than March 29, 2019. Counsel for all parties shall appear for a status conference on April 5, 2019 at 12:45 p.m. SO ORDERED. (Status Conference set for 4/5/2019 at 12:45 PM before Judge Ronnie Abrams.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/8/2019) (rro) (Entered: 03/08/2019)
03/29/2019	<u>23</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from the parties dated March 29, 2019 re: Joint Status Update. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 03/29/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>24</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>23</u> Letter filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties shall further update the Court no later than May 10, 2019. The status conference currently scheduled for April 5, 2019 is adjourned until May 17, 2019 at 10:30 a.m. SO ORDERED., ( Status Conference set for 5/17/2019 at 10:30 AM before Judge Ronnie Abrams.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/01/2019) (ama) (Entered: 04/02/2019)
05/10/2019	<u>25</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Counsel for Plaintiff and Federal Defendant dated 5/10/19 re: Joint Status Update. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 05/10/2019)
05/13/2019	<u>26</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>25</u> Letter filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties shall further update the Court no latter than June 17, 2019. The conference currently scheduled for May 17, 2019 is adjourned until further notice. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 5/13/2019) (ks) (Entered: 05/13/2019)
06/17/2019	<u>27</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 06/17/2019)
06/25/2019	<u>28</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>27</u> Status Report filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. The parties shall further update the Court no later than July 19, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 6/25/2019) (ama) (Entered: 06/25/2019)
07/19/2019	<u>29</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/23/2019	<u>30</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>29</u> Status Report filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/22/2019) (rj) (Entered: 07/23/2019)
09/06/2019	<u>31</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by New York Civil Liberties Union.(Belsher, Amy) (Entered: 09/06/2019)
09/09/2019	<u>32</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>31</u> Status Report filed by New York Civil Liberties Union. ENDORSEMENT: The production schedule set forth above is approved. The parties shall submit a joint status letter no later then October 18, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 9/09/2019) (ama) (Entered: 09/09/2019)
10/18/2019	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Krause, Andrew) (Entered: 10/18/2019)
10/21/2019	<u>34</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>33</u> Status Report filed by United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties shall submit a joint status report no later than December 18, 2019, and a final joint status report no later than March 10, 2020. If the parties determine that summary judgment briefing is necessary, they shall propose a briefing schedule in the March 10, 2020 status report. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 10/21/2019) (kv) (Entered: 10/21/2019)